Review of Preproposal

Us this as a guide to the your review.

**Background**
(1) Has a question of general ecological interest been posed?
(2) Is there a direct link between the question and the pattern described below?
(3) Based on the pattern described below, could a more interesting question of broader ecological interest been posed?

**Pattern -**
(1) Is there a pattern?
(2) Is the pattern well described? Could the description be improved? How?
(3) Does the pattern seem to make sense?
(4) Does the figure adequately represent the pattern? Are the axes labeled and clear? Could the figure be improved? How?

**Goal -**
(1) Do the investigators provide a general goal for the project, and one that directly follows from the observed pattern? If not, why not? Does the goal directly address the question of broad ecological significance posed in the Background section? If not, why not? Do you see other, better goals for the project.

**Working Hypotheses and specific hypotheses -**
(1) Are the working hypotheses general (they should be)?
(2) Are the specific hypotheses specific and testable? If not indicate why.
(3) Do the working and specific hypotheses follow logically from the observed patterns?
(4) Could the results of tests of specific hypotheses be used to falsify the specific and working hypotheses? They should be able to. In other words, is there some outcome of the test that would cause rejection of the specific or working hypotheses?
(5) Are the hypotheses reasonable?
(6) Are there some hypotheses that are at least as reasonable as the proposed ones that are missing from the pre-proposal?
(7) Will results of tests of the proposed hypotheses help the investigators attain the goal of the project?
Title of proposal

Pre-proposal review form (you may use this form to review the pre-proposal). Please type, or use computer or write legibly. The amount of space provided should be sufficient for most typed reviews and insufficient for most hand-written reviews. If it is convenient you may write or type or print your reviews on blank paper (but fill out the bottom and attach this form to the review). See attached sheet for description of review.

Pattern

Goal

Working and Specific hypotheses

Overall I rate this pre-proposal as being (choose one of the following):

a) outstanding (in the top 5% of pre-proposals)
b) excellent (top 20%)
c) good (top 33%)
d) average (top 60%)
e) fair (top 75%)
f) poor (below top 75%)

Signed______________________________Date________